

**MINUTES**  
**MEETING OF THE BOARD OF DIRECTORS**  
**PLANNING & EXTERNAL RELATIONS COMMITTEE**  
**METROPOLITAN ATLANTA RAPID TRANSIT AUTHORITY**

**September 24, 2012**

The Board of Directors Planning & External Relations Committee met on September 24, 2012 at 10:33 a.m. in the Board Room on the 6<sup>th</sup> Floor of the MARTA Headquarters Building, 2424 Piedmont Road, Atlanta, Georgia.

**Board Members Present**

Robert L. Ashe, III  
Harold Buckley, Sr.  
Wendy Butler, *Chair*  
Frederick L. Daniels, Jr.  
Jim Durrett  
Roderick E. Edmond  
Barbara Babbit Kaufman  
Jannine Miller\*  
Adam Orkin

MARTA officials in attendance were: General Manager/ CEO Davis Allen (Acting); Deputy General Manager/COO Mary Ann Jackson (Acting); AGMs Wanda Dunham, Ben Graham, Rod Hembree (Acting), Robin Howard, Cheryl King, Miriam Lancaster (Acting), Ryland McClendon, Elizabeth O'Neill and David Springstead (Acting); Sr. Directors Rhonda Briggins and Donald Williams; Directors Anton Bryant, Sharon Crenchaw, John Crocker, Maurice Ficklin, Garry Free, Lyle Harris, Walter Jones, Jennifer Jinadu-Wright, Ferdinand Risco and Carol Smith; Managers Emmett Crockett, Donna DeJesus, Tony Griffin, Cara Hodgson, Roosevelt Stripling, Robert H. Thomas and Marvin Toliver; Executive Manager to the Board Rebbie Ellisor-Taylor; Sr. Executive Administrator Tyra J. Wiltz; Executive Administrator Renee Willis. Others in attendance Dave Brown, Jolando Crane, Christopher Dorsey, Greg Floyd, William Jones, Don Lawrence, Tuan Vo, Robin Salter, Gregory Snyderman, Calvin Starling and Jason Ward.

Also in attendance Charles Pursley, Jr. of Pursley, Lowery & Meeks, LLP; Representative Lynne Riley of MARTOC; Steve Visser of AJC; Pam Alexander of LTK; Jim Brown of URS; Elise Castille of GSU; Jonathan S. Lewis and Nathan Soldad of City of Atlanta; Richard Markwith, P.E. of TranSystems; Jim Stokes of Livable Communities Coalition; Granvel Tate of Invest Atlanta; Brian Walker of Georgia General Assembly.

\*Jannine Miller is Executive Director of the Georgia Regional Transportation Authority (GRTA) and is therefore a non-voting member of the MARTA Board of Directors.

**Approval of the July 30, 2012 Planning & External Relations Committee Meeting Minutes**

On motion by Mr. Buckley seconded by Mr. Daniels, the minutes were unanimously approved by a vote of 7 to 0, with 8\* members present.

**Briefing - Overview of MARTA Service Standards for Fiscal Year 2013**

Mr. Crockett presented an overview of MARTA's Service Standards for Fiscal Year 2013.

- Fiscal Emergency language was added to provide more flexibility to take corrective actions in a fiscal emergency to reduce service levels or discontinue routes. During a fiscal emergency, underachieving routes may be assessed for corrective action including discontinuance at any time vs. the current one year waiting period before an underperforming route can be considered for corrective action.
- A requirement has been added to present a service assessment to the Board annually highlighting the top performing routes and routes that are most in need of productivity improvements. Route performance would also be published on the MARTA website.
- Language is added to provide flexibility to add, reduce or change the bus, rail and mobility performance measures included in the Service Standards.
- The presentation includes MARTA's Service Standards compared and contrasted with Service Standards from selected transit systems.
- Since major service reductions were implemented in September 2010, service is meeting and exceeding performance targets.
- The Board could adopt more stringent standards for route performance.

Mr. Orkin said he would like to know about ride quality and profitability.

Mr. Crockett said fare box recovery is an indicator of profitability. The Authority compares its own performance over time.

Ms. King said Research & Analysis provides a Quality of Services survey.

Mr. Orkin asked what is done about unruly riders.

Chief Dunham said incidents have been significantly reduced with the increased police presence.

Mrs. Jinadu-Wright added that Marketing is launching its nuisance behavior campaign.

Mr. Daniels asked if MARTA's performance thresholds are low.

Ms. King said Planning is working with Bus Operations – changes will be seen in Service Standards.

Dr. Edmond said it is not fair to cut an under-performing route. Some flexibility should be allowed.

Mr. Crockett said there is no automatic trigger. Route performance is based on a number of factors.

**Resolution Authorizing the Adoption of Bus and Rail Service Standards for Fiscal Year 2013**

Mr. Crockett presented this resolution for Board of Directors' approval authorizing the adoption of MARTA Rail and Bus Service Standards for Fiscal Year 2013.

On motion by Mr. Durrett seconded by Mrs. Kaufman, the resolution was unanimously approved by a vote of 6 to 0\*, with 8 members present.

Mr. Orkin abstained.

**Resolution Authorizing the General Manager / CEO to Enter into a Memorandum of Understanding with the Atlanta Regional Commission to Support the Regional Transit Data Warehouse**

Dr. Crocker presented this resolution for Board of Directors' approval authorizing the General Manager/CEO or her delegate to enter in a Memorandum of Understanding with the Atlanta Regional Commission to support the Regional Transit Data Warehouse.

On motion by Mr. Durrett seconded by Mr. Orkin, the resolution was unanimously approved by a vote of 7 to 0\*, with 8 members present.

**Resolution Authorizing a Letter Agreement with the Urban Residential Finance Authority of the City of Atlanta for an Exclusive Right to Negotiate an Edgewood/Candler Park Station Transit Oriented Development**

Ms. King presented this resolution for Board of Directors' approval authorizing the General Manager/CEO or her delegate to enter into an agreement with the Urban Residential Finance Authority of the City of Atlanta for a six-month period with the possibility of an additional ninety-day period, to negotiate exclusively on the terms of a potential Transit Oriented Development at the two south lots of MARTA's Edgewood/Candler Park station.

Mr. Ashe asked if there was a pressing need to approve the resolution today.

Ms. King said it has been out for a while; staff would like to move it forward.

Mr. Orkin said this resolution should be deferred until the Authority's new GM is in place to get their perspective.

Mrs. Butler said it is the Committee's desire to move expeditiously but there are many concepts to be explored. She agreed that it would be best to defer until a new CEO is hired.

Mr. Ashe made a substitute motion to defer the resolution for an undefined period.

Mr. Orkin seconded.

The motion was unanimously approved by a vote of 7 to 0\*, with 8 members present.

**Briefing - Potential Stations for Joint Development**

Mr. Ward briefed the Committee on Potential Stations for Joint Development.

*TOD Opportunities Overview*

- MARTA has received an increasing amount of interest in redevelopment opportunities near transit stations from the private sector and from local jurisdictions

**Planning & External Relations Committee**  
**9/24/12**  
**Page 5**

- Staff decided to identify and categorize the MARTA stations that are most likely to be redeveloped based upon a variety of factors
- A simple scoring matrix modeled after DART's TOD ranking system was created

*TOD Opportunities Matrix Overview*

- Methodology
  - Data Collected Within ½ Mile Radius
- Categories Measured
  - Developer Interest, Financial Investment, Area Demographics, Parking, Master Planning Work
- Scoring Category Tiers
  - Tier 1 = 45 Total Points
  - Tier 2 = 30 Total Points
  - Tier 3 = 15 Total Points
- Final Rankings = Most Likely Redeveloped

*Tier 1- 45 Total Points*

- Considered Most Important Criteria
  - Minimum Capital Investment Required
  - Qualified Developer Interest
  - Community/ Master Planning Efforts
- 15 Points Assigned Per Category (45 Total)
- Represents 50% of Point Total

*Tier 2 - 30 Total Points*

- Demographics & Market-Based Criteria
  - MARTA Land Available for Redevelopment
  - Area Median Household Income
  - Employment/ Jobs Density

**Planning & External Relations Committee**  
**9/24/12**  
**Page 6**

- 10 Points Assigned Per Category (30 Total)
- Represents 33% of the Point Total

*Tier 3 - 15 Total Points*

- Additional Criteria
  - Adjacent Large Properties - (Redevelopment)
  - Targeted Redevelopment Area
  - "Walk Score"
- 5 Points Assigned per Category (is Total)
- Represents 17% of the Point Total

*Top 10 Development Opportunities*

- Avondale
- Brookhaven
- Edgewood/Candler Park
- Hamilton E. Holmes
- King Memorial
- Kensington
- Lakewood/Ft. McPherson
- Lindbergh Center
- Medical Center
- Oakland City

*Potential Projects*

- Lakewood/Ft. McPherson & Oakland City
  - Approximately 8 acres at each station
  - Ft. McPherson redevelopment
  - Included in adopted LCI Plans
  - Other considerations:
    - Determination of amount of replacement parking

- Coordination with Ft. McPherson redevelopment
  - May need tax incentives to generate strong interest
  
- Brookhaven
  - 15 acres
  - LCI Master Plan & DeKalb County Zoning overlay
  - Developer Interest in area
  - New multifamily development in 2012
  - Other considerations:
    - City of Brookhaven incorporation possibility
    - Will require infrastructure improvements
    - Determination of amount of replacement parking
  
- Hamilton E. Holmes
  - 17+ acres available
  - Some expressions of interest
  - Completed LCI
  - Major bus intermodal
  - Other considerations
    - Determination of amount of replacement parking
    - May need tax incentives to generate strong interest
  
- Lindbergh Center
  - High-rise residential opportunity
  - Existing deck #2 Office Development Air-Rights
  - Hotel & multifamily development interest
  - MARTA revisioning study completed
  - Major bus intermodal
  - Other considerations:
    - Existing ground lease and neighborhood agreement
  
- King Memorial
  - Four (4) acres available at King Memorial

- Close to Grady and GSU
- New multifamily/retail development in area
- No need for replacement parking
- Other considerations:
  - Connections to station is through Grant Street underpass
- Medical Center
  - Significant interest in hotel development in 2010/2011
  - Strong CID as a potential partner
  - Re-development opportunities adjacent to station
  - Other considerations:
    - Property split between Cities of Sandy Springs and Dunwoody

***Next Steps***

- Utilize Newmark Knight-Frank Model
  - Presented at August 6, 2012 TOD Session
- Continue Partner Education
  - Potential Charrette Workshop
  - Complete ARC evaluation of Financial Eco-System
  - Technical Participation on LCI's
- Potential Schedule of PER Presentations
  - September: Overview of Existing Policies and Procedures for Joint Development, Request to Release Real Estate Financial Advisory RFP
  - October: Overview of Work Program
  - November: Partnership Roles and Activities
  - December (if meeting): Year End Overview/ 2013 Preview
  - Winter 2013 - Prepare to Request Release of TOD RFP/Q



## **Planning & External Relations Committee**

**9/24/12**

**Page 9**

Ms. Miller stated that all parties need to understand the benefit costs – for MARTA, for local jurisdictions and for the region and the economy. She asked that assessments include potential success rate.

Mr. Ashe said this is a strong beginning. He thanked staff for their work.

Mrs. Butler said the Committee would like to look at what can be done to better communicate with the market and help staff advance these projects.

Dr. Crocker said staff will hold a series of ongoing briefings.

### **Briefing - Advertising Policy**

---

Mr. Griffin briefed the Committee on the Authority's Advertising Policy, current advertising contracts and advertising revenue opportunities.

MARTA's Ad Policy includes but is not limited to: 1) print advertising inside its rail stations 2) print advertising inside buses and on buses and rail cars 3) video displays inside rail stations 4) video displays inside its buses and trains 5) print advertising on bus shelters inside MARTA service area and 6) print advertising, billboards, banners, video displays or similar devices upon its facilities, structures and property.

#### *Current Advertising Contracts*

- CBS Transit Advertising Contract
- CBS Advertising Bus Shelters
- CBS SignPost/Rail Network

#### *Major Policy Restrictions*

- Alcohol advertising – restricted in and on transit vehicles
- Non-commercial advertising – not allowed other than those relating to transit advocacy and campaigns adopted by the Ad Council
- Advertising of a sexual nature (or considered obscene) – restricted as defined by the O.C.G.A. 16-12-80 Code (material that depicts or describes, in a patently offensive way, sexual conduct which predominantly appeals to the prurient interest)

*Potential New Advertising Revenue Concepts*

- Allow alcohol advertising
- Wrap limits increased
- Ad on I-75/85 overpass at Civic Center Station
- Billboard on MARTA property
- Advertising on MARTA website
- Station Naming Rights

Ms. Miller said MARTA should be cautious in opening up alcohol advertisements.

Mrs. McClendon commented that MARTA is already using alcohol advertisements on bus shelters.

Mr. Daniels said MARTA must be creative and show incentives for both sides.

**Briefing - Quality of Service**

---

Ms. Smith briefed the Committee on MARTA's Quality of Service survey.

- A total of 5,728 interviews were conducted during FY12
- The reliability of the overall results is +/- 1.3% at the 95% confidence level
- MARTA's FY 2012 Annual Quality of Service Study results reflect customer opinions which were collected from September 2011 through June 2012
- This time period includes the on-going impacts of the major service reductions and fare increase that were implemented in the fall of 2010 and the initial impacts of the fare increase which took effect in early October 2011
- The annual presentation of General Rider Survey addresses overall customer satisfaction, loyalty and the analysis of over 40 different service attributes
- MARTA's perceived performance is rated in six (6) service dimensions including Cleanliness, Customer Service, Employee Performance, Mechanical Reliability, On-Time Performance and Safety
- During FY 2012, the Office of Research and Analysis further strengthened partnerships with operational Offices by providing the Passenger Environment Survey (PES)

**Planning & External Relations Committee**

**9/24/12**

**Page 11**

- The PES evaluates specific environmental passenger amenities and services associated with rail cars, buses and stations
- These amenities and services affect customer satisfaction levels and QOS\ performance ratings were compared to scores from the PES:
  - Twelve out of 41 performance attributes that were asked in the FY11 QOS were compared to corresponding scores on the PES, of which 5 improved
  - Overall, 10 out of the 41 attributes that were asked in FY11 improved. Six represent Cleanliness attributes, while 4 were distributed among Employee Performance, Customer Service, On-Time Performance and Mechanical Reliability dimensions

**Other Matters**

---

No other matters came before the Committee.

**Adjournment**

---

The Planning & External Relations Committee meeting adjourned at 12:20 pm

Respectfully submitted,

  
Kellie N. Mobley  
Senior Executive Administrator to the Board